More than likely, you already use formative assessment in your classroom as you observe whether or not your students have grasped concepts, mastered knowledge, developed and applied skills, or created products according to the guidelines you provided. And you are probably using that informal assessment to tweak your lessons, to clarify for students the learning targets of the lesson, to try an alternative approach, or to group students for specific tasks or skill development.

The new emphasis on formative assessment in Kentucky schools is intended to give teachers guidance on how to make that informal process more intentional, to help them provide the most effective learning experience for students, and to document what they are doing to inform their communication with students, parents, fellow teachers, and administrators.

As with formative assessment of any classroom activity, the first step to developing and using formative assessment in integrated instruction is to clearly identify what you want to assess and why.

Consider these questions:

• **Is your primary purpose in developing an integrated learning plan to use the arts as a tool to address a learning target in social studies?**

  Example: In order to engage your students in learning about the lives of African Americans who enlisted in the Union Army at Camp Nelson, you assign them to conduct research using primary documents and to write and perform short dialogues based on their research. (See the lesson “Give Us a Flag” in the Social Studies Arts Toolkit prototype Civil War Era folder or online at [www.ket.org/lincoln](http://www.ket.org/lincoln).)

• **Is your primary purpose to enrich an arts unit by integrating the historic or cultural context of an art form?**

  Example: In order to enhance a hands-on activity on percussive music, you include background information about Native American culture and drumming. (See the lesson “Music and Culture/Creating Simple Rhythms” at the KET Music Arts Toolkit website [www.ket.org/artstoolkit/music/lessonplan/137.htm](http://www.ket.org/artstoolkit/music/lessonplan/137.htm).)

• **Do you have separate learning targets in both content areas?**

  Example: You want your students to analyze the John B. Neagle portrait of Henry Clay of Kentucky as part of a unit on antebellum life, AND, as an extension, you want your students to create self-portraits that include symbolism to express various facets of their lives. The two activities are linked to deepen students’ understanding of both Social Studies and Arts and Humanities, but the learning targets are different for each activity and require separate formative assessment. (See the activity “Reading a Portrait,” in the Historic Archaeology: Ashland, the Henry Clay Estate file of the Historic Archaeology folder of the Social Studies Arts Toolkit prototype.)
Do you have learning targets that address both content areas?

Example: You want your students to analyze the painting *Manifest Destiny* by John Gast, 1872, from both a social studies and an artistic perspective; to identify the purpose of the painting; and to create a painting using symbolism and the element of contrast to communicate one impact of westward expansion in the 1900s. (See example on page 22 of this file.)

KEYS TO QUALITY CLASSROOM ASSESSMENT

The Kentucky Department of Education recommends the book *Classroom Assessment for Student Learning: Doing it Right–Using It Well* by Richard J. Stiggins, Judith A. Arter, Jan Chappius, and Stephen Chappius (Assessment Training Institute) as a guide to developing and using formative assessment. The authors stress that before you can determine the method and timing of assessment, it is critical to know why you are assessing and what you are assessing.

WHAT IS FORMATIVE ASSESSMENT?

“Formative Assessment” means a process used by teachers and students during instruction to adjust ongoing teaching and learning to improve students' achievement of intended instructional outcomes.

While summative assessment is an assessment of learning administered after the learning has taken place, formative assessment is an assessment for learning used during the learning process to measure progress toward a learning target.

Information from a formative assessment allows teachers and students to identify any gaps in the learning process and to make adjustments to close the gap while it is still possible. As you determine what kind of assessment to use, consider who will use the results and how. You, as the teacher, will use the results to gauge individual, small group, and overall class progress toward your learning targets, make mid-course corrections in teaching, and determine how to address specific issues that arise.

If you are part of a teaching team or if you are collaborating with another teacher on an integrated unit, sharing the results of the assessment of learning that took place in your room will alert your teaching partners to gaps that might impact how they teach their portion of the unit. They might also be able to give you ideas on how to adapt your teaching. Another use of formative assessment specific to team teaching is that it can identify students who have such a good grasp of one content area that they can be a resource to the teacher in the other content area.

GET THE STUDENTS INVOLVED

Formative assessment can also be used to target problem areas for individual students. If there are other adults (resource teachers, afterschool tutors, parents, or caregivers) or peer tutors who work with this student, you might ask them to focus on this particular area.

Students should be active participants in the assessment process. Formative assessment should enable students to assess their own learning as well as benefit from teacher or peer assessments communicated to them through supportive, descriptive feedback. In order for students to participate in and benefit from the process, they must understand exactly what is expected of them. Learning targets must be specific and clear.
WHAT TO ASSESS: FIVE CATEGORIES OF LEARNING TARGETS

Each learning target that you set for your students should be derived by deconstructing the standards. This is temporarily complicated by the fact that the standards for both Social Studies and the Arts and Humanities will be re-written over the next few years. In the interim, teachers are advised to use the Core Content for Social Studies and the Program of Studies for Arts and Humanities.

Even though the standards will change, the process for deconstructing them to create student-friendly (comprehensible) learning targets will remain the same. Deconstructing the standards simply means breaking them down into manageable objectives for a lesson or unit and then creating learning targets that apply the objectives to a specific activity or project.

There are different types of learning taking place in every classroom. For the purposes of formative assessment, the Stiggins book categorizes learning targets into five categories. The first four of these build on each other:

- **Knowledge** targets are facts and concepts that we want students to know.
- **Reasoning** targets focus on how students use what they know to reason and solve problems.
- **Skills** targets demonstrate how students use their knowledge and reasoning to act skillfully.
- **Product** targets require students to use their knowledge, reasoning, and skills to create a concrete product.

**Dispositional** targets are in a category of their own. They target student attitudes and feelings about learning and are used not to assess student learning but to provide teachers insight into how their students learn and how they feel about that learning. Although students would never be held accountable for dispositional targets, assessing them can be of great value to teachers in assessing the success of their teaching strategies. They are especially helpful when teachers are first experimenting with integrated instruction.

Determining which category each of your learning targets fits into will help you to determine appropriate formative assessment methods.

Let’s break down the steps of developing formative assessments for each of the four integrated learning plans listed in the introduction.
EXAMPLE ONE:  GIVE US A FLAG

Summary of unit: This unit is intended primarily for 8th grade classes and will require five 50-minute sessions to complete. After examining primary source documents dealing with Camp Nelson, the Union Army supply depot and recruiting station for African-American soldiers in Jessamine County, Kentucky, students create dialogues/plays featuring characters who might have been at Camp Nelson in 1864-65.

This lesson is found in the Civil War Era folder of the Social Studies Arts Toolkit prototype and at the KET website www.ket.org/Lincoln.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Big Idea</th>
<th>Students will (from standard)</th>
<th>Students will (learning target)</th>
<th>Type of Target</th>
<th>Formative assessment method suggestions</th>
<th>Interval and Documentation Suggestions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government and Civics</td>
<td>SS-08-1.3.1 Students will explain and give examples of how significant United States documents (Declaration of Independence, Constitution, Bill of Rights) established democratic principles and guaranteed certain rights for all citizens.</td>
<td>Students will build on prior knowledge of historical documents such as the Declaration of Independence and the U.S. Constitution that state the fundamental values and principles of American representational democracy, e.g., liberty, justice, individual human dignity.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Perspective</td>
<td>SS-08-5.1.1 Students will use a variety of tools (e.g., primary and secondary sources) to describe and explain historical events and conditions and to analyze the perspectives of different individuals and groups (e.g., gender, race, region, ethnic group, age, economic status, religion, political group) in U.S. history prior to Reconstruction.</td>
<td>Using primary source documents, students will learn what life was like for African Americans who enlisted in the Union army and their families.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Perspective</td>
<td>SS-08-5.1.2 Students will explain how history is a series of connected events shaped by multiple cause-and-effect relationships and give examples of those relationships.</td>
<td>Students will learn about the contributions Black Americans made in the struggle to secure freedom for American slaves.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Perspective</td>
<td>SS-08-5.2.4 Students will describe the political, social, economic, and cultural differences (e.g., slavery, tariffs, industrialism vs. agrarianism, federal vs. states’ rights) among sections of the U.S. and explain how these differences resulted in the American Civil War.</td>
<td>Students will learn that, although Kentucky was a slave-owning state, many Kentuckians opposed slavery and fought for its abolishment.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structures - Skills and Concepts</td>
<td>AH-8-SA-S-DT2 Students will use the elements of drama in creating and performing dramatic works independently and with others. AH-8-SA-U-1 Students will understand that the elements of music, dance, and drama are intentionally applied in creating and performing.</td>
<td>Working in pairs or threes, students will write and perform short dialogues/plays no longer than three minutes. Tell them you expect a clean copy of the script to be turned in the day after they have performed.</td>
<td>Product (script)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
HOW TO ASSESS

The developer of this learning plan identifies specific learning targets (concepts/objectives and activities) that focus on social studies, but the developer also indicates that this lesson addresses POS in Arts and Humanities as well as social studies Core Content.

Because the learning targets are specific to social studies, it is appropriate that the culminating assessments (open response and multiple choice) assess learning in social studies only. However, since the unit integrates drama, formative assessment in arts and humanities/drama is also appropriate to guide students toward a successful learning experience.

The developer provides scaffolding for the script writing activity through a mini lesson outlining the pattern the short plays should follow and setting explicit parameters. From this, a simple rubric can be developed and used by the student groups as a formative self-assessment tool and/or by the teacher as a means of providing descriptive feedback as s/he checks “with the groups as they work to keep students on task, make suggestions, and answer questions.”

The developer has also assigned daily tasks that can be used for formative assessment. Because these are written responses that demand more than an extremely short answer that is either right or wrong, they are called (in the context of formative assessment) extended written response. With this in mind, we can now complete the final two columns.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Big Idea</th>
<th>Students will (from standard)</th>
<th>Students will (learning target)</th>
<th>Type of Target</th>
<th>Formative assessment method suggestions</th>
<th>Interval and Documentation Suggestions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Government and Civics</td>
<td>SS-08-1.3.1 Students will explain and give examples of how significant United States documents (Declaration of Independence, Constitution, Bill of Rights) established democratic principles and guaranteed certain rights for all citizens.</td>
<td>Students will build on prior knowledge of historical documents, such as the Declaration of Independence and the U.S. Constitution, that state the fundamental values and principles of American representational democracy, e.g., liberty, justice, individual human dignity.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>Group discussion and teacher observation</td>
<td>Day 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Create a checklist of the essential facts you want the class to recall and check them off as students demonstrate recall.

Target a few students and make a note of their participation and/or recall.
| Historical Perspective | SS-08-5.1.1 Students will use a variety of tools (e.g., primary and secondary sources) to describe and explain historical events and conditions and to analyze the perspectives of different individuals and groups (e.g., gender, race, region, ethnic group, age, economic status, religion, political group) in U.S. history prior to Reconstruction. | Using primary source documents, students will learn what life was like for African Americans who enlisted in the Union army and their families. | Knowledge | Extended written response (primary document assignment) | Day 3 Kept in student folder |
| Historical Perspective | SS-08-5.1.2 Students will explain how history is a series of connected events shaped by multiple cause-and-effect relationships and give examples of those relationships. | Students will learn about the contributions black Americans made in the struggle to secure freedom for American slaves. | Knowledge | Extended written response (Plan Your Character and Plan Your Script assignments) Selected Response (Multiple choice) | Day 4 Kept in student folder After performance |
| Historical Perspective | SS-08-5.2.4 Students will describe the political, social, economic and cultural differences (e.g., slavery, tariffs, industrialism vs. agrarianism, federal vs. states' rights) among sections of the U.S. and explain how these differences resulted in the American Civil War. | Students will learn that, although Kentucky was a slave-owning state, many Kentuckians opposed slavery and fought for its abolition. | Knowledge | Extended written response (Open Response and scoring rubric) | After performance Kept in teacher files |
The developer of this learning plan was very explicit that the student performances on the final day “should be a celebration of the students’ work, so keep the responses very positive.” This is good advice. No instruction on performance skills was included in the instruction, so the final product (the performance) should not be assessed in the usual way. However, providing positive feedback is a useful form of limited formative assessment and also an instructional strategy that draws student attention to what was successful in their performance, giving them ideas to incorporate into future projects.

**HOW TO COMMUNICATE AND USE THE RESULTS OF FORMATIVE ASSESSMENT**

The final consideration in formative assessment is how to use the results to improve teaching and learning as it is happening as well as in designing future learning plans. Summative assessment is a means of measuring and documenting a student’s learning accomplishments. Once the score is recorded, the process is over. But formative assessment is a process that can guide teachers and motivate students to improve the teaching and learning experience.

Formative assessments are not graded. They are not about accountability. They are about helping students see how to take control of their learning and become more successful.

In the “Give Us A Flag” lesson, for example, the assessment of prior knowledge on Day 1 can be integrated immediately into instruction. You might involve students in creating a “What We Know” chart to help them recall your studies of the historic documents and guide them to complete it correctly, using your checklist as a guide. You might also note which students seem to have difficulty recalling the prior knowledge and place them with students that have a stronger recall when you group the students on day 3. You might provide struggling students with a review sheet. If a large number of students are struggling with this, you may need to add a day to the unit for review of prior knowledge.

In the lesson “Give Us a Flag,” feedback from the teacher to the student on the primary document assignment can help students develop successful character and script plans by alerting them if they have misunderstood some information from their primary document source. It can also provide direction for the character and script plans if the teacher draws attention to a strong point on this assignment.

The teacher might provide feedback through written or spoken communication, but the feedback should be focused on aspects that can be improved and descriptive enough that each student understands what needs to be changed before s/he starts working on the next step. It is not necessary to point out everything that needs improvement on the
assignment. If your objective is for students to communicate what they have learned about what life was like for African Americans who enlisted in the Union army and their families, that should be the focus of your evaluation and your individual feedback.

The formative assessment will also alert you to trends among your students that might require mini lessons or reinforcements in another content area. If a large percentage of your students have difficulty accurately reporting the name and website address of their document, you might insert a five-minute lesson on that topic. If a large number of them have trouble identifying the type of document, you might share this information with their reading teacher and discuss how you could work together to address this gap.

**DOCUMENTING THE PROCESS**

It is not necessary to create a scoring rubric for every formative assessment, but you do want to document the process. If your feedback is written, make a copy of one or two of the primary document assignments with your notes to keep in your files. If it is spoken, keep notes on one or two of the conversations. One teacher in Letcher County writes notes on label sheets, noting the student's name, the date, and the interaction and later transfers the labels into notebooks that she keeps on each student. This allows her to see the pattern of her interactions with each student, to identify strengths and gaps in their learning, and to consider modifications that might better meet the student's needs. It also provides documentation for student or parent conferences.

In the “Give Us a Flag” example, formative assessment of the script could be completed by each group as a self-assessment before they do their performance, giving them a chance for revision before the performance. Students will need a rubric to guide this process so they know exactly what to look for based on the parameters set for the assignment.

Involving students in developing the rubric will clarify your expectations and allow them to understand exactly what constitutes excellence in the finished script. It is also a powerful motivator, allowing students to feel in control of their learning and giving them a roadmap to track their progress. If your students have not had experience in this process before, it is well worth providing extra time to teach them how to develop a rubric.

If at all possible, provide a model of a short play that exemplifies the pattern you asked them to follow. Students need to know where they are going (model of excellence), where they are now (formative assessment), and how to close the gap (feedback). That is the essence of formative assessment. As *Classroom Assessment for Student Learning* puts it:

> Student involvement is a critically important shift in our traditional and conventional perspectives regarding the role of assessment in promoting effective schools; the most important instructional decisions (that is, the decisions that contribute the most to student learning) are made, not by the adults working in the system, but by the students themselves. Students decide whether the learning is worth the effort to attain it. Students decide whether they believe they are capable of reaching the learning targets. It is only after students make these decisions in the affirmative that we, their teachers, can impact their learning lives. So part of our classroom assessment job is to keep students believing in themselves as learners through the effective use of classroom assessment.

It is particularly important to document this portion of your formative assessment to contribute to your school's documentation for the Program Review for Arts and Humanities.

The culminating assessment pieces in the “Give Us a Flag” unit (open/constructed response and multiple choice) could be used as formative or summative assessment. You might decide to use the multiple choice as a formative assessment to review the salient facts you want students to retain and to prepare them for the open/constructed response as a summative assessment.
DISPOSITIONALLY SPEAKING

A final formative assessment of this unit might be dispositional, to give you an idea of how the students felt about learning in this way. There are several ways you might obtain this information.

- Give them a statement and ask them to check their level of positive or negative feelings. For example: I enjoyed learning about Camp Nelson by writing a short play about it.
  
  ___ Strongly agree
  ___ Somewhat agree
  ___ No opinion or neutral
  ___ Somewhat disagree
  ___ Strongly disagree

In this instance, their reaction to the experience might be affected by their group experience as much as by their feeling about integrating drama into a social studies unit. You could separate these reactions by also including a statement about group work and allowing them to assess that separately.

- Ask: What did you enjoy most about this unit? What could have made this learning experience more meaningful for you?

EXAMPLE TWO: MUSIC AND CULTURE/CREATING SIMPLE RHYTHMS

Next let’s consider an integrated lesson where the priorities are reversed: The emphasis is on the Arts and Humanities, and Social Studies content is integrated to enrich the learning.

Summary of Learning Plan: This learning plan is intended for primary classes and will require one or two 50-minute sessions to complete. The unit begins with a discussion of Native Americans as the first Americans and a viewing of the KET Arts Toolkit video segment of Dennis Banks playing “Grass Dance Song” on the drum. Students discuss drumming in Native American cultures before and after the video. Students make homemade drums and learn to play simple rhythms.

This lesson is available at the KET Music Arts Toolkit website [www.ket.org/artstoolkit/music/lessonplan/137.htm](http://www.ket.org/artstoolkit/music/lessonplan/137.htm)

The Arts and Humanities Program of Studies targets for the learning plan are:

- **AH-P-SA-S-Mu1** Students will begin to recognize and identify elements of music (rhythm, tempo, melody, harmony, form, timbre, dynamics) using musical terminology
- **AH-P-HA-S-Mu1** Students will begin to associate music they listen to or perform with specific cultures (Native American, Appalachian, West African); describe in simple terms how the music reflects the cultures.

The final assessment is a performance assessment that addresses the first bullet, and there are also formative assessments built into the learning plan. It is appropriate to add a formative assessment that also addresses the second bullet and the related bullet from the Social Studies Core Content:

- **SS-EP-2.1.1** Students will describe cultural elements (e.g., beliefs, traditions, languages, skills, literature, the arts). Because of the initial discussion, it is also appropriate to include formative assessment of historical perspective:

  - **SS-EP-5.2.2** Students will identify and compare the early cultures of diverse groups of Native Americans (e.g., Northwest, Southwest, Plains, Eastern Woodlands)
If we translate these standards into learning targets expressed as “I can” statements specific to the activities in the lesson, it becomes easier to identify the types of learning targets and to select appropriate formative assessment types.

The creator of this learning plan opted not to assess the process of making the drum. It is not necessary to develop a formative assessment of everything that takes place in any instructional unit, only those that you, as the teacher, consider most important.

## Music and Culture: Creating Simple Rhythms Connections and Assessment Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Big Idea</th>
<th>Students will (from standard)</th>
<th>Students will (learning target)</th>
<th>Type of Target</th>
<th>Formative assessment method suggestions</th>
<th>Interval and Documentation Suggestions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arts and Humanities Structures</td>
<td>AH-P-SA-S-Mu1 Students will begin to recognize and identify elements of music (rhythm, tempo, melody, harmony, form, timbre, dynamics) using musical terminology</td>
<td>I can manipulate my drum.</td>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>As students practice on their drums, you can circulate taking notes on their initial attempts, provide feedback, and note progress.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I can make a sound on the drum.</td>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>These notes can be kept in a class folder or inserted into notebooks on individual students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I can use the mallet (if a mallet is used).</td>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>Observe and evaluate initial efforts and improvements after feedback.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I can manipulate the mallet.</td>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>You might target different students for this assessment than you did for the first four.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I can copy a drum pattern.</td>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>Assess and provide feedback on each element above to allow students time to improve before moving to the final assessment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>I can create an original drum pattern.</td>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>Use the rubric for individual assessments to be kept in your files. If possible, record the performances.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arts and Humanities</td>
<td>AH-P-HA-S-Mu1</td>
<td>I can recognize Native American drumming with a slow and steady beat.</td>
<td>Reasoning</td>
<td>Selected response (ask student to identify two characteristics of Native American drumming as modeled by Dennis Banks).</td>
<td>After viewing and discussing the video. You could document this by creating a checklist for student responses or by keeping copies of 1-2 written responses.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanity in the Arts</td>
<td>Students will begin to associate music they listen to or perform with specific cultures (Native American, Appalachian, West African); describe in simple terms how the music reflects the cultures.</td>
<td>Students will begin to associate music they listen to or perform with specific cultures (Native American, Appalachian, West African); describe in simple terms how the music reflects the cultures.</td>
<td>Students will describe cultural elements (e.g., beliefs, traditions, languages, skills, literature, the arts).</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>Personal communication or selected response (multiple choice or short answers) With 2nd and 3rd grade students, you might use Extended Written Response in the form of exit slips.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Studies Cultures</td>
<td>SS-EP-2.1.1</td>
<td>I can list four ways that drumming was used in Native American culture.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>After viewing and discussing the video. You could document this by creating a checklist for student responses or by keeping copies of 1-2 written responses.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students will describe cultural elements (e.g., beliefs, traditions, languages, skills, literature, the arts).</td>
<td>I can list four ways that drumming was used in Native American culture.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>After viewing and discussing the video. You could document this by creating a checklist for student responses or by keeping copies of 1-2 written responses.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Studies Historical Perspective</td>
<td>SS-EP-5.2.2</td>
<td>I can identify Native Americans as the first Americans.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>After viewing and discussing the video. You could document this by creating a checklist for student responses or by keeping copies of 1-2 written responses.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Students will identify and compare the early cultures of diverse groups of Native Americans (e.g., Northwest, Southwest, Plains, Eastern Woodlands).</td>
<td>I can identify Native Americans as the first Americans.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>After viewing and discussing the video. You could document this by creating a checklist for student responses or by keeping copies of 1-2 written responses.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The last three learning targets could be assessed together on one multiple choice form or through group discussion and observation of student participation.
USING EXIT SLIPS

The exit slip can be a powerful tool for assessing not only what individual students have learned from the day’s activities but also for providing feedback about how successfully you have communicated with students.

For example, one day, an archaeologist visited two third grade classes. She told the students in each class that corn was an important part of the diet of Native Americans who lived in Kentucky during the late pre-historic period.

One teacher followed up with a multiple choice quiz, in which almost every student correctly responded that corn—not peanut butter, cheese, or apples—was a part of the Native American diet in Kentucky in the 1500s.

The second teacher had students complete an exit slip about what they had learned that day that they found interesting. The majority of students reported that they had learned that in the 1500s most Native Americans were on diets!

For the “Music and Culture” example, a final dispositional assessment could be done through group discussion. What did you like about this activity? Would you like to make more musical instruments? Would you like to create more music?

EXAMPLE THREE: READING A PORTRAIT

Our next example begins with an integrated activity in which students analyze a portrait from a social studies perspective.

Summary of Learning Plan: This activity is part of a unit on archaeological research conducted at Henry Clay’s estate, Ashland. Students analyze a portrait of Henry Clay, interpreting the symbolism embedded in the portrait. As an extension, students create a self-portrait in mixed media collage including symbols representative of their own lives.

This activity can be found in the Historic Archaeology folder of the Social Studies Arts Toolkit prototype.
The chart for developing formative assessment for the first component of this lesson would look like this:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Big Idea</th>
<th>Students will (from standard)</th>
<th>Students will (learning target)</th>
<th>Type of Target</th>
<th>Formative assessment method suggestions</th>
<th>Interval and Documentation Suggestions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
<td>SS-8-CS-S-1 Students will demonstrate an understanding (e.g., speak, draw, write, sing, create) of the nature of culture by exploring cultural elements (e.g., beliefs, customs/traditions, languages, skills, literature, the arts) of diverse groups in the United States prior to Reconstruction and explain how culture served to define specific groups and resulted in unique perspectives.</td>
<td>Students will analyze a historic portrait to identify symbols and interpret their significance in the 1840s.</td>
<td>Reasoning</td>
<td>Extended Written Response (Portrait Analysis Worksheet) The teacher could provide feedback, or students might team up to compare their responses and self-assess.</td>
<td>The formative assessment should be completed right after the guided discussion and in advance of the open response assessment to allow time for students to clarify their understanding. 2-3 samples can be kept in the teacher's file.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

For the second component, the self-portrait in a mixed-media collage, the chart would look like this:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Big Idea</th>
<th>Students will (from standard)</th>
<th>Students will (learning target)</th>
<th>Type of Target</th>
<th>Formative assessment method suggestions</th>
<th>Interval and Documentation Suggestions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Structures</td>
<td>AH-8-SA-S-VA5 Students will identify a variety of subject matter in visual artworks (representational – e.g., landscape, portrait, still life, nonrepresentational – e.g., abstract, non-objective).</td>
<td>Understand portraits as subject matter</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>Personal communication (guided discussion after viewing videos)</td>
<td>This should occur after students have viewed the videos and before they begin their own composition. Make notes about the participation of several individual students. Keep in teacher’s files or in notebooks for individual students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Processes</td>
<td>AH-8-PA-S-VA2 Students will use knowledge of the elements and principles of art and art terminology to create expressive artworks</td>
<td>Create a self-portrait with symbols using the elements of art and principles of design and a variety of media to communicate ideas, feelings, or experiences.</td>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Performance assessment</td>
<td>Self assessment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Processes</td>
<td>AH-8-PA-S-VA2 Students will use knowledge of the elements and principles of art and art terminology to describe and critique their own work and the work of others</td>
<td>Participate in peer assessment of portraits created by classmates.</td>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>Performance assessment</td>
<td>While the student are participating in peer assessment, the teacher can observe how skillfully they use their knowledge of the element and principles, specifically unity of composition, variety of size, and the three aesthetic types.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**PEER ASSESSMENT AND LIZ LERMAN’S CRITICAL RESPONSE PROCESS**

This example uses peer assessment, and it is a skill that must be taught and a practice that must be facilitated. Otherwise, peer reviews can be intimidating at best and extremely hurtful at worst.

An excellent model for peer assessment is Liz Lerman’s Critical Response Process. Leman, a choreography, writer, and founder of the artistic company Dance Exchange, created a process that can be used to obtain feedback on any creative endeavor. The process provides a structured framework for a respectful dialogue between the artist and the peer reviewers with the teacher playing the role of facilitator.

A ROADMAP FOR MEANINGFUL DIALOGUE

The process engages participants in three roles:

The artist offers a work-in-progress for review and feels prepared to question that work in a dialogue with other people;

responders, committed to the artist’s intent to make excellent work, offer reactions to the work in a dialogue with the artist; and

facilitator initiates each step, keeps the process on track, and works to help the artist and responders use the process to frame useful questions and responses.

The Critical Response Process takes place after a presentation of artistic work. Work can be short or long, large or small, and at any stage in its development. The facilitator then leads the artist and responders through four steps:

1. Statements of Meaning: Responders state what was meaningful, evocative, interesting, exciting, or striking in the work they have just witnessed.
2. Artist as Questioner: The artist asks questions about the work. After each question, the responders answer. Responders may express opinions if they are in direct response to the question asked and do not contain suggestions for changes.
3. Neutral Questions: Responders ask neutral questions about the work. The artist responds. Questions are neutral when they do not have an opinion couched in them. For example, if you are discussing the lighting of a scene, “Why was it so dark?” is not a neutral question. “What ideas guided your choices about lighting?” is.
4. Opinion Time: Responders state opinions, subject to permission from the artist. The usual form is “I have an opinion about ______, would you like to hear it?” The artist has the option to decline opinions for any reason.

In the lesson “Reading a Portrait,” students have participated in two distinct but interrelated learning experiences. To assess whether you (or you and your collaborating teacher or artist-in-residence) were successful in helping student see the links between the two activities and between the two content areas, you might construct a formative assessment for the unit. This could be assessed through personal communication or extended written response. You might want to assess all students as a group, individually, or only some selected students. Questions might include:

- How did analyzing the portrait of Henry Clay help to prepare you to use symbols in your own self-portrait?
- What did the combination of these activities help you to understand about how symbols can be used in art to communicate ideas or values?
- If you had used one of the symbols in the Henry Clay portrait in your own self-portrait, would it have had the same meaning as it did in his time?

You could also construct a dispositional assessment, such as:

- How did you feel about doing an art project related to what you were learning in social studies?
- How did you feel about being able to connect something you were learning in social studies to your own life?
EXAMPLE FOUR: PICTURING U.S. HISTORY – MANIFEST DESTINY

This is the only one of the four examples that is fully integrated. It not only gives equal weight to standards and learning targets in both Social Studies and Arts and Humanities but also because the learning that takes place is in both content areas simultaneously.

Summary learning plan: Students analyze a painting to consider the power of visual art to both reflect and impact public perception of political ideas and cultural stereotypes and will create a painting to communicate one impact of westward expansion.

The full lesson plan is found at the end of this file.

Charting the lesson for purposes of formative assessment, we break it down like this:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Big Idea</th>
<th>Students will (from standard)</th>
<th>Students will (learning target)</th>
<th>Type of Target</th>
<th>Formative assessment method suggestions</th>
<th>Interval and Documentation Suggestions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Structures</td>
<td>AH-8-SA-U-2: Students will understand that the principles of design and the elements of visual art are intentionally applied in creating works of art.</td>
<td>Students will analyze the symbols and elements and principles of visual art that John Gast used to persuade viewers that westward progress was both inevitable and moral.</td>
<td>Reasoning</td>
<td>Personal communication (group discussion) Extended written response (exit slips)</td>
<td>Group discussion Day 1. Keep a checklist with notes about individual students’ participation. Exit slips on day 1-4. Copy and keep a few examples in teacher files. For struggling students or students who are not participating, keep copies of their exit slips in their individual notebooks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Humanities</td>
<td>AH-8-HA-S-VA3: Students will examine visual artworks from various world cultures and explain how artworks reflect the culture, cultural beliefs, or blending of cultures; use examples to illustrate how artworks have directly influenced society or culture.</td>
<td>Students will create a PowerPoint presentation to explain how John Gast’s painting American Progress was used to encourage travel and migration to the west.</td>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Extended Written Response (exit slips)</td>
<td>Exit slips on days 2-4. Copy and keep a few examples in teacher files. For struggling students or students who are not participating, keep copies of their exit slips in their individual notebooks. Take notes on the peer review process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Purpose</td>
<td>AH-8-PCA-S-VA2: Students will create new art and choose and experience artworks created to fulfill a variety of specific purposes.</td>
<td>Students will create a work of visual art to express a historic perspective about one impact of Manifest Destiny.</td>
<td>Product</td>
<td>Personal communication (interactions with students as you observe their work in progress)</td>
<td>Take photos of individual products or a video of the entire exhibit. Keep copies of artist statements for a few students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture and Society</td>
<td>SS-08-2.3.1: Students will explain how conflict and competition (e.g., political, economic, religious, ethnic) occurred among individuals and groups in the United States prior to Reconstruction.</td>
<td>Students will explain how American Progress depicts competition between Euro-Americans and Native Americans.</td>
<td>Reasoning</td>
<td>Personal communication (group discussion)</td>
<td>Day 1 Checklist of student participation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>SS-08-3.4.2: Students will describe how new knowledge, technology/tools and specialization increased productivity in the United States prior to Reconstruction.</td>
<td>Students will describe the changes in transportation technology represented in the painting American Progress.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>Extended Written response</td>
<td>Exit slips, Day 1. Keep copies of a few exit slips. For struggling students or students who are not participating, keep copies of their exit slips in their individual notebooks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>SS-08-4.3.2: Students will explain why and give examples of how human populations changed and/or migrated because of factors such as war, disease, economic opportunity and technology in the United States prior to Reconstruction.</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>Personal communication (group discussion)</td>
<td>Day 1 Checklist of student participation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geography</td>
<td>SS-08-4.2.1: Students will describe how regions in the U.S. prior to Reconstruction were made distinctive by human characteristics (e.g., dams, roads, urban centers) and physical characteristics (e.g., mountains, bodies of water) that created advantages and disadvantages for human activities (e.g., exploration, migration, trade, settlement).</td>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>Personal communication (group discussion)</td>
<td>Day 1 Checklist of student participation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Perspective</td>
<td>SS-08-5.1.1: Students will use a variety of tools (e.g., primary and secondary sources) to describe and explain historical events and conditions and to analyze the perspectives of different individuals and groups (e.g., gender, race, region, ethnic group, age, economic status, religion, political group) in U.S. history prior to Reconstruction.</td>
<td>Skill</td>
<td>Personal communication (Monitor group progress by circulating through the room and asking students questions about how they are using primary resources to document the perspective of westward expansionists.)</td>
<td>Document through note taking or a checklist, and save notes or checklists on your interaction with several students.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ASSESSMENT TIPS

Note that in the assessment plan charts, each learning target for the unit is derived from a standard and defined as a type of learning target for which there is an appropriate formative assessment method. If you cannot define the learning target and do not intend to assess it, consider leaving it out of your learning plan.

You may occasionally realize that you need to add a learning target to your learning plan if you discover that the class needs reinforcement of prior knowledge or of a skill that you thought they had previously mastered (such as manipulating an object downloaded from the internet, interpreting text, or creating a PowerPoint). Formative assessment plays a key role in alerting you to these gaps before they undermine the learning process.

Classroom Assessment for Student Learning: Doing it Right – Using It Well relates target types to content standard key words and provides explanations and examples of each type.

- **Knowledge** targets are facts and concepts.
- **Reasoning** targets require students to use what they know and to solve problems.
- **Skills** targets require students to use knowledge and reasoning to act skillfully.
- **Product** targets require students to use knowledge, reasoning, and skills to create something concrete.
- **Dispositional** products are students’ attitudes about learning.

PEER PARTNERING AND FEEDBACK

The “Picturing U.S. History” lesson includes peer assessment in a partnering situation. As with peer assessment in a group context, this process must be structured and monitored. Students will tend to either give a general compliment to one another (“I think it looks great!”) or hurt one another’s feelings (intentionally or unintentionally).

An example of a peer feedback form is included in “Picturing U.S. History.” It is based on Liz Lerman’s Critical Response Process and focused on the specific assignment. It can be modified for use in other situations.

DEVELOPING AND USING YOUR OWN PLANS FOR FORMATIVE ASSESSMENT OF INTEGRATED UNITS

Once you become skilled in creating a formative assessment plan for your learning plans, you may find that it is an easy way to outline and assess the lesson before you present it, whether you are creating the lesson or using a lesson from another source.

As you develop the chart, you will see how your learning targets are derived from a relevant standard and whether they are clear enough to be assessed. You will see if you need to adapt the lesson to fit the level of your class or if you need to provide prior learning experiences to prepare them for this unit. As you look across the formative assessments you have developed for a period of time, you will be able to identify gaps or redundancies in what you are teaching and how.

Periodically review the formative assessments you have collected to monitor how individual students and the class as a whole are progressing. Do you see trends or patterns? Are there problem areas that crop up repeatedly? Are there strengths you can build on in individual students or in the class as a whole? Do the results give you ideas for grouping students or for experimenting with a new teaching strategy?
Engage your students in the formative assessment process whenever and however possible. Students often fail because they do not know exactly what they are missing. Providing descriptive feedback to students can help them monitor their own learning as it is happening and identify areas where they might need help. Encourage them to ask questions about your feedback so that the feedback is truly valuable to them. Engage them in creating rubrics and in self and peer assessment. Let them know that learning is a journey you are all taking together and that it requires give and take communication to reach your goals.

LESSON PLAN

PICTURING U.S. HISTORY: MANIFEST DESTINY

Overview: Students will consider the power of visual art to both reflect and impact public perception of political ideas and cultural stereotypes and will create a painting to communicate one impact of westward expansion.

Standards and Learning Targets:

Arts and Humanities

Structures
AH-8-SA-U-2: Students will understand that the principles of design and the elements of visual art are intentionally applied in creating works of art.
- Students will analyze the symbols and elements and principles of visual art that John Gast used to persuade people that westward progress was both inevitable and moral.

Humanities
AH-8-HA-S-VA3: Students will examine visual artworks from various world cultures and explain how artworks reflect the culture, cultural beliefs, or blending of cultures; use examples to illustrate how artworks have directly influenced society or culture.
- Students will create a PowerPoint presentation to explain how John Gast's painting *American Progress* was used to encourage travel and migration to the West.

Purposes
AH-8-PCA-S-VA2: Students will create new art and choose and experience artworks created to fulfill a variety of specific purposes
- Students will create a work of visual art to express a historic perspective about one impact of Manifest Destiny.

Social Studies

Culture and Society
SS-08-2.3.1: Students will explain how conflict and competition (e.g., political, economic, religious, ethnic) occurred among individuals and groups in the United States prior to Reconstruction.
- Students will explain how *American Progress* depicts competition between Euro-Americans and Native Americans.

Economics
SS-08-3.4.2: Students will describe how new knowledge, technology/tools, and specialization increased productivity in the United States prior to Reconstruction.
- Students will describe the changes in transportation technology represented in the painting *American Progress*.

Geography
SS-08-4.3.2: Students will explain why and give examples of how human populations changed and/or migrated because of factors such as war, disease, economic opportunity, and technology in the United States prior to Reconstruction.
• Students will describe the motivation for migration of various groups represented in the painting American Progress. SS-08-4.2.1: Students will describe how regions in the U.S. prior to Reconstruction were made distinctive by human characteristics (e.g., dams, roads, urban centers) and physical characteristics (e.g., mountains, bodies of water) that created advantages and disadvantages for human activities (e.g., exploration, migration, trade, settlement).

• Students will describe the physical characteristics of the United States and the changes in human characteristics as Euro-Americans move westward depicted in the painting American Progress.

Historical Perspective

SS-08-5.1.1: Students will use a variety of tools (e.g., primary and secondary sources) to describe and explain historical events and conditions and to analyze the perspectives of different individuals and groups (e.g., gender, race, region, ethnic group, age, economic status, religion, political group) in U.S. history prior to Reconstruction.

• Students will use three primary documents (American Progress, another work of visual art, and excerpt from a contemporary guide book) to document the perspective of westward expansionists.

Background reading for teacher: John Gast, American Progress, 1872 by Martha A. Sandweiss at the Picturing U.S. History website picturinghistory.gc.cuny.edu/item.php?item_id=180

**ACTIVITIES:**

**Day 1:** Remind students that you have been learning about the politics of westward expansion and the concept of Manifest Destiny. Lead students in creating a list of what they know and what unanswered questions they have.

Project an image of the painting American Progress by John Gast (often referred to as “Manifest Destiny”), and lead students through a visual inventory of the painting using the questions below to guide discussion:

1. What is your eye immediately drawn to? How did Gast use the elements of art and principles of design to draw attention to the central figure?
2. Describe the central figure (gender, age, ethnicity, clothing, pose, what she is holding). What can you infer from the image? How did Gast use the elements of art to convey the inevitability of forward movement?
3. From left to right, “read” the other people portrayed (gender, age, ethnicity, clothing, pose, what each is holding, what each is doing).
4. What can you infer from each image? (occupation, reason for migrating, level of technology).
5. How did Gast use imagery and the elements of art (line, color, value, texture, shape) and principles of design (emphasis, contrast, balance, movement, transition) to communicate cultural and gender stereotypes?
6. How did Gast use symbols and the elements of art (line, color, value, texture, shape) and principles of design (emphasis, contrast, balance, movement, transition) to persuade viewers that Manifest Destiny was morally right?
7. From left to right, “read” the geography, including both the physical and human characteristics.
8. From left to right, “read” the advances in transportation technology.
9. What lines in the painting (actual and implied) are horizontal? Diagonal? Wavy? Form an arch?

An excellent resource for a student worksheet analyzing the painting from both an artistic and a social studies perspective can be downloaded from the Oakland's Museum of California's website museumca.org/goldrush/curriculum/8g/81104022.html

You can use this worksheet or ask students to complete an exit slip.
Exit Slip
1. Identify one way that the artist used lines to express forward movement.
2. Identify one way that the artist used the principle of contrast in this painting to persuade viewers that westward expansion was enlightening.
3. Identify one symbol the artist used to persuade viewers that westward expansion was morally right.

Days 2-4:
Students conduct research into the origins and purpose of the painting at the Picturing U.S. History website picturing-history.gc.cuny.edu/item.php?item_id=180

Project the guidebook for which American Progress was commissioned (Croffut’s New Overland Tourist and Pacific Coast Guide), found at the Google Books website.

(Note: Be sure to download this before class. It is a large file and slow to load.)

With students, read the title page.

Assign student to work in groups of 3-5, and give them the following assignment. Monitor group progress by circulating through the room and asking students questions about how they are using primary resources to document the perspective of westward expansionists. Document through note taking or a checklist, and save your notes or checklists on your interaction with several students.
ASSIGNMENT: A TRAVEL GUIDE TO WESTWARD EXPANSION

You may divide the first five tasks among group members, and pool your findings to create a group PowerPoint presentation.

1. Read and summarize the preface.

2. Copy the two parts of American Progress and combine them to make one image.

3. Scroll to the “Annex” at the end of the book and copy the portion that describes American Progress.

4. Select another image from the book and copy it (use cropping, resizing, rotation, and combining as needed.)

5. Scroll to the “Annex” at the end of the book and copy the portion that describes the selected image.

6. Create a PowerPoint presentation comparing and contrasting the two images in terms of:
   • content (what is in the pictures);
   • depiction of transportation;
   • use of line;
   • use of contrast;
   • overall artistic composition;
   • expression of historical perspective (what does the print convey about the west and westward expansion);
   • purpose of the artwork (using references from the Annex);
   • how the artwork and comments in the Annex serve to document the perspective of westward expansionists that westward expansion was inevitable and morally right.

Your PowerPoint should use the images (whole and cropped sections) and quotes from the Annex to support each point that you make.

On days 2 and 3, have students write exit slips answering the following questions:

1. What did you accomplish today?

2. What did you learn that was new?

3. What are your plans for tomorrow?

These exit slips, in addition to your observations and interactions, will keep students on track and allow you to monitor their progress. This will allow you to decide if you need to assign students to work on this project as homework and/or provide extra class time to present mini-lessons on analyzing art in terms of line and contrast, computer skills, or interpreting the text in the annex.

On day 4, students present their PowerPoint presentations and critique each other’s work using Liz Lerman’s Critical Response Process.

Days 5-6 (additional time if needed)

Students are to create a work of art communicating one impact of westward expansion making strong use of line and contrast. They may focus on a positive or negative impact, and they may illustrate the impact on people or groups of people (cultures and historic perspective); trade and enterprise (economics); land use and patterns of migration (geography); or politics (civics and government).
Student will write an artist statement explaining:
- their purpose in creating the work;
- how the content in their art expresses their personal point of view or the point of view of one group of people during the era of westward expansion;
- how they have made effective use of line and contrast in their composition.

Monitor student progress by circulating through the room and asking students questions about where they are going with their composition. Document through note taking or a checklist, and save the notes or checklists on your interaction with several students.

Provide interim opportunities for students to work with partners, and provide peer feedback on works in progress using the peer feedback form. As teacher, you can assess student progress and grasp of the key points of the assignment by monitoring these peer review sessions and reviewing the peer feedback forms.

Exhibit the completed art and artist statements. Document the project through photos or a video of the exhibit.
Peer Feedback: Works in Progress

Artist Name ________________________________________________________________

Peer Reviewer Name _________________________________________________________

Artist: Before meeting with your peer reviewer, briefly describe where you are in the process by completing the statements below:

1. My overall idea is ______________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________

2. So far I have __________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________

3. I plan to ______________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________

Next meet with your peer reviewer and exchange peer feedback forms and art works in progress.

Peer Reviewer: After reading your artist’s summary of the work in progress, consider the work and answer the following questions:

1. What do you find most striking, interesting, or evocative in the work at this point? ____________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________

2. How is the artist making use of lines (real or implied) in the work? ________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________

3. What examples of contrast do you see in the work so far? _________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
   _______________________________________________________________________________________________
Exchange the forms again, and read how your reviewer has responded to your work in progress. Discuss each work, taking turns playing the role of artist of your own work and reviewer of your partner’s work.

Artists may ask questions about their own work. Reviewers may express opinions in direct response to the question but should not make suggestions unless the artist directly asks for a suggestion.

Reviewers may ask neutral questions such as, “Why did you decide to…” and “What do you plan to …” but may not ask questions with negative overtones. Artists may respond by explain their process or plans.

After the discussion, artists should complete the section below:

This discussion helped me to ____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________
____________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________________